

## DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 247 546

CS 007 761

AUTHOR Watson, Dorothy J.; And Others  
TITLE Two Approaches to Reading: Whole-Language and Skills.  
PUB DATE May 84  
NOTE 42p.; Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the International Reading Association (29th, Atlanta, GA, May 6-10, 1984). Funding provided by the Graduate School and Office of Research of the University of Missouri, Columbia.  
PUB TYPE Reports - Research/Technical (143)  
EDRS PRICE MF01/PC02 Plus Postage.  
DESCRIPTORS \*Educational Theories; Language Experience Approach; Language Skills; \*Reading Instruction; \*Reading Research; \*Reading Skills; Teacher Attitudes; Teacher Effectiveness; \*Teaching Methods; Teaching Styles  
IDENTIFIERS \*Theory Practice Relationship; \*Whole Language Approach

## ABSTRACT

A study was conducted to observe and describe two reading instruction procedures stemming from two different theoretical influences. Two teachers, one skills and one whole language oriented, were selected on the basis of peer and administrator recommendation, among other qualifications. Their stated instructional base and theoretical orientations were measured using the Theoretical Orientation to Reading Profile (TORP). Data were collected from video tapes and their transcriptions and from teacher journals. The results were analyzed using these questions as guides: On what unit of our language and linguistic system did the teacher focus the children's attention? What aspects of reading were emphasized? Was the reading material contingent on the student, teacher, or material? and, What attitude toward reading specific text did the teacher encourage? Findings showed that in every category of observable data the teachers adhered closely to their theoretical model, and that, in diametric opposition to the instructional position of the skills teacher, the whole-language teacher focused children's attention on the largest unit of language suitable for the situation, encouraged the children to construct meaning sensible to them and their lives, permitted deviations from text in allowing miscues, involved children in planning, utilized library books and other texts, and encouraged children to "think about and feel" what they read. (CRH)

\*\*\*\*\*  
\* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made \*  
\* from the original document. \*  
\*\*\*\*\*

X This document has been reproduced as  
received from the person or organization  
originating it.  
Minor changes have been made to improve  
reproduction quality.

- Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official NIE position or policy.

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS  
MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Dorothy J. Watson

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES  
INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC) "

ED247546

## TWO APPROACHES TO READING: WHOLE-LANGUAGE AND SKILLS

Dorothy J. Watson  
Shirley Crenshaw  
Dorothy King

Department of Curriculum and Instruction  
School of Education  
University of Missouri - Columbia  
Columbia, Missouri

Funded by  
The Graduate School and Office of Research  
University of Missouri - Columbia  
Columbia, Missouri 65211

1984

TWO APPROACHES TO READING: WHOLE LANGUAGE AND SKILLS

Director of Research. . . . . Dorothy Watson

Coordinator of Research. . . . . Shirley Crenshaw

Data Collection. . . . . Joan Sorrels  
Barbara Bell  
Catheryn Copeland  
Vanette Reese  
Marie Ice  
Linda Romig  
Dorothy Watson

Data Coding. . . . . Shirley Crenshaw  
Dorothy King  
Joan Sorrels  
Nancy Antonio  
Dana Coad  
Edith Dean  
Barbara Branson  
Dorothy Watson

Data Analysis. . . . . Shirley Crenshaw  
Dorothy King  
Paul Crowley  
Donelle Pyle  
Dorothy Watson

Episode\_One:

Teacher: Who can give me a sentence about a bottle that is going to break? Kelly?

Kelly: A bottle is going to break.

Teacher: A bottle is going to break. Very good. Okay. What about the silent e? What is the a going to say? Nick?

Nick: Its name.

Teacher: Its name. Would everybody be careful for a minute? Did everybody put periods? Okay. Very good.

Episode\_Two:

Teacher: Did you and your partner like that story?

Ronald: A lot. It reminded me of Jack\_and\_the Beanstalk.

Harold: But it was Jim.

Teacher: What did you like best about the story?

Ronald and Harold: When Jim got his coin.. Gold!

Teacher: Would you be interested in ...

Ronald: Reading it to the kindergarten kids?

Teacher: Yes, that would be great, but I was wondering if you would like to write another ending to ...

Harold: What Jim did with his gold.

Ronald: And illustrate it.

Episodes from 'two teachers' reading instruction.

## TWO APPROACHES TO READING: WHOLE LANGUAGE AND SKILLS

### Goal:

Motivation to conduct this study came from teachers, administrators and parents asking for data supported research that accurately described reading instruction in a classroom taught by a teacher holding a whole-language theoretical orientation to reading. As educators and parents rethink approaches to the teaching of reading and writing in order to make curricular decisions, the more urgent becomes their plea for a straight-forward picture of exactly what it is teachers promote and encourage in their classrooms. The designation of "whole-language teacher" is new to many. Therefore, our original goal was to present as clearly as possible what we saw going on in a whole-language teacher's reading class. (The term whole-language refers to the utilization of all the systems of language --graphophonemic, lexicogrammatical and semantic-- within situational contexts that necessitate and promote reading and writing). A whole-language teacher is one who views language as a complete organization of systems, sees strength and sense in the totality rather than in the parts of language, and bases instruction on that assumption. Such teachers have been defined, but not described.

Parents and educators welcomed our proposal, but suggested that the study would be more informative if we simultaneously looked at a teacher who held a different approach to reading, an approach that was more familiar to them. That is, it would be helpful, if we also studied instructional procedures of a teacher who felt that to learn to read, children must extract units of language from the totality of language, master those pieces and then move on to larger units and more mastery.

### Research Methodology:

We wanted to observe and describe two teaching procedures stemming from two different theoretical influences. Our basic questions about the teachers' instructional approaches could best be answered by observing each teacher in the classroom when the students were participating in activities that were natural and expected in

that setting. We hoped to keep to a minimum any alteration of classroom-environments and teacher-student interactions.

Therefore, a methodology that borrows heavily from ethnographic research and provides for indepth description seemed appropriate for our purposes. It was necessary to use techniques that allowed observers to work with wholes rather than minute parts, that allowed phenomena to be described as well as counted, and that used the language of educators rather than the language of laboratory or experimental researchers.

#### Theoretical Orientation to Reading and Selection of Teachers :

Three major assumptions underlying this study were: 1. teachers have a theoretical base on which they build their reading program, 2. researchers can find out what that base is, and 3. teachers' beliefs will be evident in their teaching practices.

Theoretical orientation in this study is defined as the underlying beliefs upon which a teacher bases, organizes and presents the reading curriculum. A major orientation, for example, has to do with the unit of language on which teachers ask their students to focus. This unit can range all the way from phonemes and letters to idea units that emerge in a complete text (an exit sign, a story, a poem).

Harste and Burke (1976) indicated that teachers' decisions are based on their theoretical orientation and that those decisions involve:

1. what goals are set for the reading program;
2. what reading behaviors are thought of as good or bad;
3. what procedures, materials and activities are used for diagnosing reading problems;
4. what weight is given to diagnostic information;
5. what procedures, materials and activities are used for instruction;
6. what environment is thought of as most conducive for reading proficiency; and
7. how reading growth is measured.

Additionally, Dillon and Searle (1981) in their study of the role of pupil language in classroom learning concluded that children's classroom language revealed to some extent the teacher's theoretical base.

In this study, selection of both teachers was based on three criteria: 1. excellent recommendations by peers and administrators, 2. expressed interest in the research, and 3. ability to articulate a point of view about teaching reading.

The Theoretical Orientation to Reading Profile (TORP) developed and validated by DeFord (1978) confirmed each teacher's stated instructional base and provided a uniform measure that profiled individual theoretical orientation. Using the TORP twenty-eight statements about reading and reading instruction were presented to the two volunteer teachers.

On thirteen (13) of the twenty-eight (28) items the two teachers were diametrically opposed in their responses. On a five point scale the skills teacher strongly agreed and the whole-language teacher strongly disagreed with the following statements.

Item No.

TORP Items

- 2. An increase in reading errors is usually related to a decrease in comprehension.
- 6. When children do not know a word, they should be instructed to sound out its parts.
- 9. Reversals (e.g., saying "saw" for "was"), are significant problems in the teaching of reading.
- 11. It is important for a word to be repeated a number of times after it has been introduced to insure that it will become a part of sight vocabulary.
- 16. Young readers need to be introduced to the root form of words (run, long) before they are asked to read inflected forms (running, longest).
- 21. Formal instruction in reading is necessary to insure the adequate development of all the skills used in reading.
- 22. Phonic analysis is the most important form of analysis used when meeting new words.
- 25. It is important to teach skills in relation to other skills.

The whole-language teacher strongly agreed, and the skills teacher strongly disagreed with the following items.

- 15. When coming to a word that is unknown, the reader should be encouraged to guess based on meaning and go on.
- 17. It is not necessary for a child to know the letters of the alphabet in order to learn to read.
- 18. Flashcard drill with sightwords is an unnecessary form of practice in reading instruction.
- 26. If a child says "house" for the written word "home," the response should be left uncorrected.
- 27. It is not necessary to introduce new words before they appear in the reading text.

On four items, the whole-language teacher and the skills teacher were three steps apart. On the profile below, the whole-language teacher's preferences are circled, and a square surrounds the skills teacher's responses.

20. Controlling text through consistent spelling patterns (The fat cat ran back. The fat cat sat on a hat.) is a means by which children can best learn to read.

SA SD  
1 121 3 4 (5)

28. Some problems in reading are caused by readers dropping the inflectional endings from words.

1 121 3 4 (5)

5. Materials for early reading should be written in natural language without concern for short, simple words and sentences.

(1) 2 3 141 5

12. Paying close attention to punctuation marks is necessary to understanding story content.

111 2 3 (4) 5

The teachers' responses to the following six items were two steps apart.

1. A child needs to be able to verbalize the rules of phonics in order to assure proficiency in processing new words.

SA SD  
1 2 131 4 (5)

3. Dividing words into syllables according to rules is a helpful instructional practice for reading new words.

1 2 131 4 (5)

8. The use of a glossary or dictionary is necessary in determining the meaning and pronunciation of new words.

1 2 131 4 (5)

10. It is a good practice to correct a child as soon as an oral reading mistake is made.

1 2 131 4 (5)

19. Ability to use accent patterns in multisyllable words (pho'to graph, pho to'gra phy, and pho to gra'phic) should be developed as a part of reading instruction.

1 2 131 4 (5)

23. Children's initial encounters with print should focus on meaning, not upon exact graphic representation.

(1) 2 131 4 5



The skills and the whole-language teachers were one step apart in their responses to the following items.

4. Fluency and expression are necessary components of reading that indicate good comprehension.	SA					SA
	1	2	(3)	144	5	
13. It is a sign of an ineffective reader when words and phrases are repeated.	1	2	3	141	(5)	
14. Being able to label words according to grammatical function (nouns, etc.) is useful in proficient reading.	1	2	3	141	(5)	

On two of the items the teachers agreed in their answers.

7. It is a good practice to allow children to edit what is written into their own dialect when learning to read.	SA					SA
	1 (1)	2	3	4	5	
24. Word shapes (word configuration, big) should be taught in reading to aid in word recognition.	1	2	3	4	(5)	

The whole-language teacher was in complete agreement with DeFord's Whole-Language Profile on twenty-seven (27) of the twenty-eight (28) items. The item on which there was disagreement had to do with fluency, number 4.

The skills teacher fell comfortably into either the Skills or Phonics Profile on all but two (2) items, the two in which she agreed with the WL teacher and with the Whole-language Profile, numbers 7 and 24.

DeFord's Phonics Profile and Skills Profile were combined in this study for two reasons. First, the skills model includes word attack exercises that require the matching of letters and sounds (phonics). Secondly, the skills teacher started her program with a strong phonics base and moved steadily into skills activities, but never abandoned teaching phonics.

#### Procedures:

Data were collected by means of video taping on eight occasions in each school during the year. The first taping in the whole-language (WL) classroom was made on the first day of school; the first taping in the skills (S) classroom was made on the fourth day of the school year. Tapes were made during August, October, January and May. It was usual procedure to set up the camera before school started and to tape during the entire morning, approximately three and one-half hours. Field notes were taken by the researchers during the data collection. The teachers were encouraged to keep journals and at

the close of the entire data collection the teachers viewed the tapes and/or read the typescripts, thus having an opportunity to agree or disagree that the tapes were reflective of their teaching. In no case did a teacher ask that any episode be removed from the study.

A staff of two teacher educators, a coordinator and eleven graduate students participated in collecting, transcribing, coding and analysing the data. Funding for the research was provided by the University of Missouri Graduate Research Department.

The two schools involved in the study were in two rural districts each approximately twenty miles from Columbia. The socio-economic status, of the two populations, including ethnic, racial, sex and class size were similar, if not identical.

### Analysis of Data:

After data were collected on video tapes, the research team viewed the tapes with five basic questions in mind:

1. On what unit of language was the teacher focusing the children's attention?
2. On what linguistic system was the teacher focusing the children's attention?
3. What aspects of the reading process were emphasized?
4. Was the reading instruction contingent on the student, the teacher or the material? and
5. What attitude (stance) toward reading specific text did the teacher encourage?

A preliminary coding form was designed to record the pertinent information. During subsequent viewings categories were revised and new categories were added, but the basic questions remained the same. The video tapes were transcribed and the text marked at one minute intervals. A team of four began coding data at the end of each minute, but soon saw the necessity of coding all observable activities occurring throughout the minute interval -- to preserve as much information as possible. Because of the minute duration it then became evident that several categories could be coded during the sixty second interval, for example, during minute eighty six (86) the following were coded: attention to: 1. sub-morphemic units, 2. letter sound relationships, 3. spelling, and 4. mixing letters in words. As new information emerged from the data it became imperative to revise and sharpen the categories. After all tapes were timed and transcribed and the final coding procedures established, paired teams coded transcripts separately and then compared their coding. When ambiguity occurred, the video tape was viewed again by the coders and other team members to resolve questions. The coding was verified by a final coder who once more compared typescripts with the tapes.

### Descriptive Examples of Data:

Teachers and researchers agreed that all examples presented below are representative, not atypical episodes, of their instruction.

#### I. Attention to Units of Language

This category indicates the teachers' focus on parts and on integrated units or wholes of language. The emphases are labeled submorphemic, word, sentence, and discourse. (ST indicates the

skills teacher's class, WLT indicates the whole-language teacher's class. Episodes are separated by one space.)

A. Submorphemic: Submorphemic indicates that the teacher focused attention on units of language smaller than the word, that is, on letters, phonemes, syllables or even on parts of letters:

ST See, that line has a cross on it. It's a t, tuh, tuh, tuh.

ST We're going to say the sound three times...fuh, fuh, fuh.

B. Word: When the linguistic focus is on the word the word it can be considered in isolation, minimally related to the text, or significantly grounded in the context of the discourse or the context of the situation in which it appears.

ST T Okay. Very easy word. Tell me, Chris.  
C Without.  
T With - out. What kind of word is it?  
C Compound.  
T Compound word. Very good. Okay. Now I have a real hard word.

ST T Today I gave you two words to write. Now, you're going to make a sentence. I gave you the words. First words. Figure them out. Helen, what are they?  
C It's a rainy day.  
T Wait. First of all let's do the words. What is this?  
C Rainy.  
T And?  
C Rainy day.  
T Okay. Rainy day. Give me a sentence in this. It...  
C It is a rainy day.  
T It is a rainy ....  
C Day.

WLT T How do you start a letter (correspondence)? Yes, with Dear.

WLT T Is there anybody who needs to copy Aaron's name?  
C Yeah  
T Would you do that right now 'cause I want to erase it. How many of you haven't made Chuck's new baby brother a card yet?  
Ch Me, No (don't erase it).  
T Okay, if you need the name just copy it. This is the new baby's name.

C. Sentence: When this category was coded the attention to the sentence involved: 1. direct focus on the sentence, 2. attention to

words within that sentence, or 3. focus on the sentence in relation to the entire text.

- ST T You write my first sentence.
- ST T We will each one read one sentence.
- ST T Okay, turn your paper over. Write the sentence, My cat is black. Don't forget your capitals. Don't forget your periods. Don't forget your spaces. Good, real nice. Don't forget your stop signs. All right. Let's see what you write next. Oh, Nick you're a good listener. What are you going to do? She-likes-to-play. You can write She-likes-to-play. She is talking about the cat. She is a girl.
- ST T Okay, I remember looking at the story and I saw the little cat in the tree. Would somebody take the word cat, somebody take the word tree and give me a good sentence about the cat and the tree. Melissa?
- C He plays in a tree.
- T Is it a he?
- C She plays.
- T That's a good one. She plays in a tree.
- WLT T&Ch (Singing Eensy Weensy Spider)
- T Good. Do you think you could help me write that on the board? Did you know I didn't know that song until yesterday? So I don't know if I know the words unless I look at it.
- Ch (Begin singing.)
- C Shhh.
- T Who wants to tell me the first line?
- C I will. Eensy Wensy Spider
- T (Under breath) I don't know if I can spell it. Eensy Weensy Spider. Okay Mike, what's next?
- C (General talking, but no direct answer.)
- T Don, what's next?
- C Went up the water spout.
- T Writes on the board - Went up the water spout...
- Ch Singing - Went up the water spout. Down came the rain. (Continues putting the song on the board as the children dictate.)

D. Discourse: Attention to discourse was coded when books, stories, and plays were discussed and read. In some cases this overt focus on discourse changed to attention to sentences, words, and even submorphemic units.

- ST T (In reading group) We're going to look at the book. Now, one of the things is, one sentence remember? Make it sound like a good sentence and also don't lose your place. We want to make it a nice, good story. Okay. We'll start with Chris and go around

this way. (The children read one sentence at a time around the reading circle.)

- ST T Get your pointers. Let's read the story about -- My Cat.
- Ch My cat is...
- T Wait, wait, wait, wait, wait. That was the title. Let's read the title again. Ready.
- T&Ch My Cat
- T Okay. Now we're going to read the story. Ready?
- Ch My cat is black. She likes to play.
- T Boy, that's about the shortest story we've had all week, isn't it? Usually our stories have about five or six sentences. Black cat is black. What Sue?
- C My cat.
- T My cat. Wait a minute now. What do you have to put at the beginning of a sentence, Chris?
- C A capital.
- T Make sure you put a capital. My. It is My cat. It belongs to me. Now, this time the word my. What does the y say? The e or i sound, Jess? Muh, eye.
- C The i sound.
- T The i sound. This time -- My cat is black. All right.
- Did they put a period? Good. Make sure that they can see the period.

Stories led to discussions about the content and illustrations of the story or resulted in another reading activity, a writing activity, making illustrations or dramatization.

- WLT T (After reading It Could Be Worse ...What was your favorite part?
- Ch (Children tell their favorite part.)
- T As soon as you decide on your favorite part, get a sheet of art paper and draw the part you like best. If you need to come look at it (the book), come on.
- Ch. (General movement and talking)
- T ...We'll hold up our pictures and put them in the order they happened in the story. And then we'll have our own book.
- Ch (Children work on their illustrations often talking with others around them.)
- T ...Maybe we can put them (the illustrations) in order as they happened.
- C What if there's two of them.
- T If there's two of them, we'll put them right next to each other. Okay, first thing was this page. This showed what?
- C The house.
- (T&Ch continue until their book is complete.)

## II. Attention to Linguistic and Pragmatic Systems

For purposes of this study the linguistic system is divided into three subsystems: graphic/phonemic, lexical/grammatical and semantic.

A. Graphic/phonemic : The graphic/phonemic subsystem refers to any aspect of language that involves attention to visual or auditory cues or to the relationship between the visual and auditory cues. In this study nine aspects of this subsystem emerged:

1. Attention to letter formation and appearance of work was coded.

- ST T Erase the P and make it start at the dotted line.  
 T Make your H start way at the top. Erase it and try again. Just think about how we did that yesterday. You came up to my desk and made it real perfect.  
 T Oh! got the hicoughs. Can you erase the Y and start at the dotted line. Much better. Good. Now, try the C again. That's right. Very good,  
 T Goodness, look at the hicoughs. Not a single one of those are sitting on that line. Let's see if we can sit it on the line. That's nice, Nat. Where's your eraser, Fred?

2. The punctuation category was coded when punctuation marks were named or explained.

- ST T What do we put at the end of a sentence? A period or a question mark or an exclamation point, right?
- ST T Look here Nick - 28. What comes after the 28? Yes, don't forget your commas. That's where you have to take a breath. Can you make your g's start at the dotted line?....Let me see, Jock. Oh, where's your stop sign? Don't forget your stop sign.
- ST T Every sentence has a capital and a period. We aren't on that one yet Jessica. Ready for number two? Here we go. My blank is black. Well, what's the story about, Helen?
- C Cat.  
 T Cat. Write the word cat. You should all be able to do that without looking. Wait please. That's beautiful. That one looks almost perfect. I sure do like the way Helen's put in periods. Can you see how nice she put periods at the end of her sentences? Now, number three.

WLT T Whenever you write a letter you usually say "Dear" and the person's name you're writing and then you put a little mark like that. Do you know what that is?

C Huh-uh. (No)

T That's called a comma.

Ch (Nod. No further discussion concerning commas.)

3. The category of letter recognition was marked when the children were asked to name letters by recalling or matching their configuration.

ST T Would you circle everything that starts with a G? Wait. This is not now. This is your morning work. The next one is a fox. Circle everything that begins the same way as fox. Just a moment and I'll give out your "fun sheet." Just a moment. Here is some

milk.

What does it start with, Jake?

C M.

T Dishes starts with what, Chris?

C D

T You're going to circle everything that starts this way. Okay, go to the next page...

ST T Trace the B. You make the B. Trace the little b. Make the little b. And what is this picture? It has a smiley face, but it starts with a B, buh, buh, buh

4. The category of sound recognition was marked when an attempt was made to isolate a sound or to say a sound represented by a letter or letters.

ST T D. Listen - donut, football, girl. Which one starts with D?

ST T F. Ready? F three times, fuh, fuh, fuh.  
T&Ch (Chant together. Then each child in group gives the sound when he/she is pointed to.)

T Good, ready? D three times, duh, dun, duh.

T&Ch (Chant in unison and then individually.)

The F, B, let's try the B. Everybody get your hands ready. On your throat. Ready? Your mouth does not move. Feel it down here. (T models and the children imitate.) Guh, guh, guh, let's hear it. Very good. We'll try the M. Ready? Three times, muh, muh, huh. See? My mouth goes m-m-m-. Be sure your lip is closed muh and bring it out. Okay, here we go. First picture! Take your pencils. Muh, motorcycle. Nick, what does that start with?

C M.



5. The category of phonics rules was coded when the teacher presented a phonics rule or generalization, or asked the children to recall, repeat or apply a rule.

- ST T Try the next two words, Nick.  
 C Ride, bus.  
 T Ride, bus. What does this say?  
 C Silent e.  
 T Silent e and the I says it's...  
 C Name
- ST T See if you can write the word heat - huh,eee,tuh.  
 Don't forget your two vowels go walking.
- ST T Okay, ready, help me -- heat, neat, seat, meat,  
 beat. (Children join in.) These are rhyming words.  
 Very good. The ea. Can I have my two fingers up  
 in the sky? Ready?  
 T&Ch When two vowels go walking, the first one does  
 the talking and it says its name - eee.
- ST T Oh, boys and girls, I've forgotten how, I can't  
 remember how to spell "star." Can you help me?  
 st,st,st,st, Jess?  
 C s  
 T Ed, it's not your turn. Please wait. Ssss,st,tuh.  
 C t  
 T Very good. And when I put those two sounds  
 together what do I get? What's it called, Jess?  
 (Rolls hands around and makes a brrrrr sound.)  
 C Blend.  
 T It's called a blend. Very good. Well, I've got  
 the st. Now I need an r. Can I just put an r  
 or the bossy r? Should I put a bossy r?  
 Ch (In unison) Bossy r.  
 T Bossy r. Okay. He became the star of the circus.  
 Now I have one or two boys and girls in here that  
 know a very special rule, so I'm going to let them  
 say it. Now not too many of you know this, but  
 I want you to help them. Helen and Jack? Since  
 you know this rule, can you be my helpers? He  
 became the star of the ssssss circus. Why didn't  
 I start with an s? Helen, it's a hard rule.  
 When an ...  
 C r  
 T When ...  
 C r follows a c it doesn't say k it says s.  
 T Very nice, Helen. Nice. Can you all see my period?  
 Ch Yes. No.

6. Mixing letters in words was coded when children were asked to unscramble isolated mixed-up words.



- ST T Good. Now see if you can read this. (Writes gdo on the board. I don't know how to read and I don't know how to spell. This thing goes wu, wu, wu.)  
 Ch Oh, dog, dog, dog.  
 T Chris, help me.  
 C d-o-g (As the child says the letters T repeats and writes them on the board.)

7. The category of spelling was marked when reference to spelling was made during the reading time identified by the teacher as reading instruction.

- ST T How many of you have ever seen a sign that says Y-I-E-L-D? They're yellow and they're right by a - they're by a stop sign near a school and it spelled - okay Y- put a Y, put an I and an E and an L and a D. (See below for more of this episode.)
- ST T Okay, what if I say to you that you can walk over there and get S-I-X candy bars and you thought I said this number (points to number on the board), would you get enough candy bars?
- ST T (Children are filling blanks on worksheet.) You ought to be able to spell that puh, luh, aaa. That was one of the first words we learned.... Play has a y sound. Very good. Number 6. That's a lot to fill in.
- WLT T (In response to questions about how to spell words.) If you will spell the very best way you can, I think we can figure it out.
- WLT T Pretend you can spell it. Try what you think is best and keep going with your story.
- WLT T Find my name on my mailbox. Then you'll know how to spell it.

8. The category of pictures, graphics, and gestures were coded when used during reading instruction.

- ST T All right, we've done the A. We've done the B. We've done the C. What comes next?  
 C The D.  
 T D. Ready? Pointers in the sky. We're going to do the big D first. Ready? Top to bottom. Go way back to the top and I want a big old fat tummy. Like Santa Claus. (Demonstrates how big and fat Santa's tummy should be, with gestures.) You know Santa goes out here for a big old fat tummy? I don't want any skinny tummies. Santa Claus is jolly and fat and I want you to make him real

nice and fat.

- ST T Now let's look at the pictures. I see meat, a girl and a fork. Can you find something else that starts just like gate guh, guh, gate, guh, guh, gate, Ed?
- C Fork.
- T Does it really?
- C Yeah.
- T You watch me. Now you watch.

- ST T (T is presenting the "fun sheet" (outlines of faces with parts missing). What is missing?
- C The eye.
- T The eye. What else is missing?
- C The nose
- T Noses. Right? What else is missing, Russ?
- C Mouth.
- T The mouth. On every single face I want you to put their eyes, their nose, their mouth and I don't want any sad faces. I want all happy faces. Okay?

- ST T I want you to look at the other pictures and find a picture that starts the same way. Muh, muh, meat.

- ST T This time we have a picture and a whole bunch of pictures and you're going to circle the picture. But this time you're going straight across. Tim, muh, mouse. Can you figure out what letter that starts with?

- ST T Who can figure out what that picture is? What is it, Tammy?
- C A balloon.
- T A balloon. Does it start with a b? buh, buh, balloon, buh, buh. Does it? Yes, it does. So we're going to color the balloon. We're going to color the big B's and the little b's. Okay? Next page. This is your last page.
- C It's a dot-to-dot.
- T Steven says it's a dot-to-dot and he's right, but looky here. Some of them are letters and some of them are numbers so you make sure that you keep all of the letters together and then all of the numbers.... What are we going to when we get this all done?
- C Color it.
- T Color it and make it real pretty, right?

- ST T Everybody get your hands ready. On your throat. Ready? Your mouth doesn't move. Feel it down here. (T models her hands on her throat; the children follow.) Guh, guh, guh, let's hear it. Very good. We'll try the M. Ready? Three times, muh, muh, muh.

See? My mouth goes m-m-m-m. Be sure your lip is closed, muh, and bring it out. Okay, here we go. First picture! Take your pencils. Muh, motorcycle. Nick, what does that start with?

C M.

ST T Let me show you something. (Goes to the board and writes a D.) That's a D. Watch me, Hilda. (Draws a dog out of the D.)

C A dog.

T A dog, duh dog duh,duh. Can you see the D that I made? Look. It has a big old fat tummy, doesn't it? Okay, I'll put it there. (Puts the D card in front of child.)

WLT T Does anybody know what the name of this book is?  
Ch The Bus Ride . The Bus Ride . The Bus Ride .

C And I know how to read.

T Good, you help me then if you'll stay seated I'll show you the picture. (Starts to read the story, the children join in.) There she's getting on the bus. Just like some of you girls. (Finishes story with children reading the last line of each page with teacher.)

WLT T What do you call the special paper that you write letters on?

C Stationery.

T So, I tried to make our paper look like stationery.

WLT T Yesterday I told you there was a special thing hanging in the room that reminded us of something that...

Ch Yeah. Spider.

T Yes, and we have the eensy weensy spider here.

C And this is a song.

T And this is a song. Does anyone know what the song might be?

C Yeah, "Eensy Weensy Spider."

T Let's see if we can sing it as we're reading it. Okay? At the beginning.

Ch (Sing together.)

C I want to do it again.

WLT T And what do you think this is going to be about?

C About a lion.

T About a lion. It says right there. The lion's (gestures)

Ch Tail.

T Something funny happens to this lion. (T points to the tail.)

WLT T (Shares pictures to help children make or confirm predictions.) ...There was no oatmeal in

it. It was full of something grainy and white.  
The old man tasted it carefully.

Ch Salt. Salt.

T (Shows pictures) Salt.

WLT T (Shows first page of book.) "A mother bird sat on her..."

Ch Nest.

WLT T (T uses a wordless book. The children look at the pictures and dictate a story.)

C The egg is cracking from the little chicken.

T (T writes on the board and reads as she writes.)  
The egg is cracking from the little chicken.  
Everybody ready? Okay, here's the next picture.  
Okay, Chuck.

C They are looking at the baby chicken.  
(T and children continue discussing and writing until the book is completed.)

WLT T (Reads) "And dropped me in the mountain. I heard a noise. It was an abominable snowman with a huge snowball which he threw at me." (Shows picture.)

Ch (General conversation.)

T (Reads) "I got stuck inside the snowball, which rolled down the mountain. It finally landed on the desert and began to melt. Suddenly, I heard footsteps..."

Ch I know what it is!

WLT T (Reads) "Before I could get up I heard a strange noise. A great blob of marmalade was coming towards me. It chased me across the desert..."

Ch Thump, thump.

T What's marmalade?

C Some kind of oranges.

T Nobody in here has ever eaten marmalade?

C No way!

T Look back here at this page.

C Is it jam?

T Yes, it's like jam. See it's in this jar here. If you just saw it and you didn't know what it really was, it's like jelly or jam. So that's what it is.  
(Points to picture.) It's a big blob of jam.

B. Lexical/grammatical : The lexical/grammatical subsystem in English refers to the appropriate word choice and to the appropriate word order necessary to convey meaning.

ST T Why did I say he? Why didn't I say she started to fly? Christine?

C He's a boy.  
T He's a boy.

ST T What does the s on the end mean? Jed, what does the s mean?  
C Ssssss.  
T One, more than one?  
C More than one.  
T More than one. You might see a lot of tigers at the zoo.

WLT T When you ask someone to do something, what word do you use? When you want them to do something and you want to be polite?  
Ch (General discussion)  
T I heard someone say it.  
C Please.

WLT T They say, "Dear" and then they put the person's name.

C. Semantics: Aspects of the semantic subsystem of language include label-concept matching (naming and idea), inference (using stated information to construct unstated information) and figurative language (the evocation of meaning through its similarity to something else that is stated).

ST T How many of you have ever seen a sign that says Y-I-E-L-D? (Spells the word.)  
They're yellow and they're right by a ...  
they're by a stop sign near a school and it's spelled - Y - put a Y, put an I and an E and an L and a D, and it's yellow and that is a sign that says you have to slow down, stop, be very cautious.

ST T (Reading) "It was sort of like an ostrich and very cross." Which means very mean.

WLT T (Taking dictation from children.) Up the water spout?  
Ch (Singing.) Went up the water spout. Down came the rain.  
T (Writing) Up the water spout. What's a "water spout?"  
C It's something uh,uh,it, it,uh,uh, it comes up. (Motions with arms and hands how something goes up and over.)  
C Water goes out of it.  
T Do we have a water spout in here?  
Ch No. Yes.  
T We don't?

C Yes.. yeah.

T How do we get our water? Where is it?

C Back there. (Points to sink.)  
(Dictation continues.)

WLT T Right, please write me -- I called it a note. Is  
a note the same thing as a letter?  
Ch Yes.

WLT C (Dramatizing "Eensy, Weensy Spider")  
T You're the rain? Okay, right here. Who wants to be  
the sun? All right. A sun comes here. And who  
wants to be the water spout? All right. Water spouts  
right here. If you don't want to be anything you can  
be the audience. Did we leave anything out. (Points  
to each one on chalkboard.) We got the spider, a  
water spout, rain and sun.

WLT T&Ch (Discussing The Little Old Man Who Could Not Read )  
T How did you know what the boxes said?  
C We read it.  
C I know how to read.  
T Why didn't the little old man know that?  
C 'Cause he was old.  
T He hadn't learned to read at the beginning of the  
story, had he?  
Ch (General discussion.)  
C 'Cause he didn't go to school.

WLT T How will we set up our store -- with our food?  
Ch Set it up on the tables. Use the tables. We  
will put the the boxes of cereal here. The soup  
here. (Discussion continues.)  
T That's a good idea isn't it? We'll sort them  
into what kind of food they are.  
Ch (General discussion) Get all the cereal together,  
get all the cookies together, all the crackers  
together.  
T Does anyone know what they call the person at  
the store who does this? Rusty?  
C A stocker.  
Ch Stocker, stocker.  
T A stocker - right! And there's a person hired to  
do that. So, who would like to be the stocker?  
T Now, who's another person that works at the store?  
Ch (Several comments.) I know. A man who works at  
the counter. You pay him.  
(Discussion continues as children name  
meat cutter/butcher, the baker, the manager, and  
the customers. Children act out their roles.)

WLT T Now the baby bird did not walk; he ran. Why would  
he start running, Jason?  
C He wanted to hurry and find her.

- WLT T Why didn't the bird just fly away?  
 Ch Because he couldn't fly.  
 T How could a machine do that, Karen?  
 C There's a man in there and he probably did that.

D. Pragmatics: In this study, pragmatics is considered to be the inherently social or cultural part of any instructional communication that contributes to the construction of meaning through situational contexts. There were two designations in this category: opportunity of situation, and context of situation. Opportunity of situation was coded when a teacher took advantage of the linguistic experience to elicit more language from the children; for example, children reading together with a partner, sharing their experiences and proficiencies; or when a teacher took advantage of bringing concept and label together in the context of a story, or classroom discussion. The context of situation was coded when the teacher set up a situation in which certain specific language was needed; for example, during the first day of school a teacher discussed with the children the letters she had written to each of them. This experience elicited language about names, correspondence, writing, and reading.

- WLT T What are you going to write on your Mother's Day card?  
 Ch (General talk, but no direct responses.)  
 T What would you expect to find on her card?  
 C "I love you, Mother."  
 C Daddy said to make a mother's day card.  
 C Pick some flowers. Lots of flowers.  
 C This is for Mother's Day.

- WLT T What would you expect to find to read in a grocery store?  
 C Candy and vegetables.  
 C Same as our signs.  
 C Here's the meat cutter.

### III. Attention to the Reading Process

The reading process may be defined as a cognitive act in which the reader transacts with the text by sampling from the print, predicting on the basis of text and past experiences, confirming or rejecting predictions, correcting when necessary and integrating meaning (Goodman, 1972). These aspects of the process were coded when direct instruction was evident.

A. Sampling: As children read, they were encouraged to sample from the linguistic and/or pragmatic cueing systems.

- ST T This time you have a picture of a mouse. M.  
 ...just like we did in our reading book.  
 You're going to find a picture that starts  
 the same way. Muh, milk, football, dog.  
 Which one starts the same way as muh, mouse?

ST (The children use worksheets containing individual letters and a series of drawings.)  
 C (Reading) It's a rainy day.  
 T First of all let's do the words. What is this?  
 C Rainy.  
 T And?  
 C Rainy day.  
 T Okay, rainy day. Give me a sentence in this.  
 It...  
 C It is a rainy day.  
 T It is a rainy...  
 C day.

WLT T I like you. That's right. That's the message I wrote. But what's the very first thing I wrote to start my letter? What's that?  
 Ch Our name.  
 T Your name. What is this one? (Pointing to the word "Dear.") Have you ever heard mother or daddy read a letter?  
 Ch Yes.  
 T What's the first thing people write in a letter.  
 C My name.  
 T "Dear." That's how they start letters. (Points to "Dear" as she talks.) "Dear." They say "Dear" and then they put the person's name. So, I put "Dear" and then I wrote your name. Does everyone see your name?

B. Predicting: This category was coded when the children were encouraged to predict based on text (including pictures and titles) or on their prior knowledge.

ST T Look at the first letter. Look at the picture. What is the word? (Word is one in a list of four words on a worksheet)

ST T (Showing the front of the book) Okay. Look at the little old man. What's he going to do?  
 C To go.  
 T He's going shopping.

WLT T (Reading) A mother bird sat on her...  
 Ch Nest. Egg. Egg.  
 T ...The egg jumped, it jumped and jumped and jumped and out came the ...  
 Ch Baby, baby bird, baby.  
 T ...He looked down. He did not see her. (Pause)  
 C Oh, he could fall, he could fall.  
 T I will go and look for her and he said...  
 Ch (Children make bird noises, chirping, etc.)  
 T ...It was a long way down. (Question to children) Is it true that a baby bird can't



fly right away?

Ch. No. I can't look. Yes. No.

T Can a baby bird just hatch and fly?

Ch No.

T (Reading) The baby bird could not...

Ch Fly!

T (Reading) He could not fly but he could walk.

Ch Oh, yes

Baby birds can't fly without their wings.

He got wings.

He doesn't have no feathers. No feathers.

He just doesn't have no feathers.

C. Confirming : Confirmation of a prediction was based either on text, on prior knowledge, or a combination of both.

ST T Look close. What is that letter? Does it say that?

ST T Get the words. Then you'll have it.

WLT T (Reading) He did not know what his mother looked like. He went right by her. He didn't even see her.

C Because she was behind a rock. I can tell you something.

T Abby wants to tell something.

C When I was over at Mary's and Carrie's he, me him climbed up a tree and he knew that there was a nest with eggs in it and there was four and there was only...and two snakes came and ate two of them.

T Snakes are really bad about that.

C I know.

T (Reading) He came to a kitten. Are you my mother?

Ch Kittens don't be a bird's mother.

No.

They can't lay eggs.

(Discussion involving predicting and confirming based on past experiences continue throughout the story.)

D. Correcting: This category was marked when the teacher either corrected children's reading or allowed children to correct their own reading.

ST C (Reading) You aren't big...  
T Wait. (Points to a word in the book.)  
C (Reading) You aren't that big, you know.

ST C (Reading) ...some day I'll help you, asked Mouse.

T said Mouse.

C said Mouse.

- WLT C (Reading) "On, on Monday, (self corrects) One Monday morning the king, the queen, and the (omits little) prince come (for came) to visit (omits me). But I wasn't home. So the little prince said, 'In that case I will (for we shall) return on Tuesday.' On Tuesday (omits morning) the king, the queen, the little prince, and the knight came to visit me." (The child continues reading for three pages without interruption from the teacher.)
- T Let's stop here. You did a wonderful job reading that story. Do you like it?
- C So far.
- T Do you think you are having any trouble with any of it?
- C (Points to the word "jester.") What's that?
- T What do you think it is?
- C It's him. (Points to the picture of the jester.)
- T What would you call him?
- C Silly. A clown.
- T That's exactly what a jester is! Kings and queens had jesters to entertain them.
- C Oh, jester.

E. All Systems : This category was marked when the teacher encouraged the children to sample, predict, confirm or reject, and self-correct in order to construct meaning.

- WLT T Everyone read to yourself. If you have any trouble maybe you could just do the very best you can. Try to make it make sense. But keep going. Put something in that makes sense and sounds right.
- WLT T Let's look at the pictures on the front and on the back of your books.
- Ch (Children have a variety of paperback books.)
- T Tell your partner what you think your book is about.
- Ch (General discussion)
- T Now, would you do one of two things. First, you become the author of that book. That's right. But you can't peep inside yet.
- C What else can we do?
- T If you think you would like that book you can begin reading it. Later we will check with our partner to see if we guess right about what the author wrote.
- T Who wants to be an author?
- Ch (Several respond) Me. I'm going to. Yep. Yes.
- T Who wants to read?
- Ch (Others respond) For me. Okay. Maybe.

- WLT T What is that? (Shows picture)  
 Ch A fox.  
 T&Ch (Read together) A fox got on the bus and  
 the bus went fast.  
 T What is this?  
 Ch A hippopotamus.  
 Ch A hippopotamus got on the bus and the bus  
 went fast. (This procedure is continued  
 throughout the story.)

#### IV. Sources of Register for Reading Instruction

In addition to analyzing the attention given to the units of language and the aspects of the reading process, this research investigated instructional language from another perspective. Language "resides" in social and situational contexts, an environment of meaning potential, and it differs according to context. Reading instruction in a classroom environment is a specialized context with the particular values of those involved (teacher and students) having influence on the language used. What children and teachers say is determined by what is happening at the time, who is taking part, and how language is being used to communicate. The term register refers to the language involved in a given situation. M.A.K. Halliday (1978) suggested that register is determined by field, tenor and mode. The field is concerned with the content of what is being said and includes selected vocabulary items, grammatical patterns, classes of objects and other related concepts. Tenor refers to the participants' relationships which influence the speaker's selection of mood or tone to reflect feelings and attitudes. The mode covers the channels of communication, written or spoken, and the means selected to provide organization.

In this research the category Source of Register for Reading Instruction was included in order to examine the major influences directing the action, and consequently the register, during reading instruction. The subcategories of this section are: teacher contingent, text contingent, reader contingent, and transactional. The question guiding coding was: Does the observed reading time (considered instructional by the teacher) emerge from and depend on the teacher, the text, the reader, or a transaction of all three?

A. Teacher Contingent: This category was marked when the teacher was in control, and the students' experiences depended on teacher selected activities and instructions.

- ST. T Did you know that part of listening is also  
 part of reading?  
 Ch Uh huh. (Yes)  
 T Because if you listen to my words, we're going  
 to put some words and we're going to learn to  
 read some words. Now you watch us here.  
 Okay? I'm going to put a word up here and I  
 want you to look at my word.

- ST T We're going to play a game. Okay? Here we go. Nick, can you not roll that, please?...Look at all these nice things I have. ...Okay, this is the magic picture for the letter F. Can you say F?
- Ch (Each child in group says fuh.)
- T And did you hear when you said that? Listen fuh, fuh, fuh, fuh. Can you say that? Fuh? Say it.
- Ch (Each is given a turn again.)
- T Your teeth...they sit right on your lip and you go fuh, fuh, fuh, fuh. All right, now the D. Ready? (Continues in the same manner.)

In some cases the instructional procedure was initiated by the teacher and dictated by both the teacher and the text.

- ST T Now you all are going to have to tell me in just one or two sentences something about Dumbo. Now let's remember, a sentence starts with a what?
- Ch (In unison) A capital letter.
- T Together.
- Ch (In unison again) A capital letter.
- T A capital letter. What do we put at the end of a sentence?
- C A period.
- T Or a question mark or an exclamation point. Right? Very good. Shhhh. What do, shhhh. What do we need between each word, remember?
- T&Ch (In unison) Word, space, word, space, capital, space.
- T Okay. Put your paper down. Who can tell me how the story started out? Who can give me a good sentence? Okay, Nicky, give me a nice sentence.
- C Mrs. Jumbo had a baby boy.
- T Okay. A baby elephant or a baby boy?
- C Elephant.
- T Okay. So here we go. (Writes on board) Mrs. Why did I put a capital M? It's the beginning of a ...
- C (In unison) Sentence.
- T All right. You start on your first line. Mrs. That's not an N. Look at what I did. Top to bottom. Top to middle. Top to Middle. Top to bottom. (Demonstrates how to make a capital M) Mrs. Jumbo. Oh, why did I put a capital J? I thought the capital was over here. Steve?
- C That's her name.
- T That's her name. Very good. That's her name. (Continues until the first sentence is written. All right, now you write my first sentence.

Mrs. Jumbo had a baby boy. You all have at least one finger between each word? ...You have to write the whole sentence. Jock, what's the matter? Oh, it tore. I'll fix it in a minute. You've got another line, Nick. You have to go until you get to the period. Go until you get clear down to the period. Yeah, you can go ahead because you have more room. You see, my board isn't like your paper, but if I did it on the paper. Oh, no. I wanted you to have your paper turned around this way, Sugar, but go ahead. Your story and your picture will just be at the bottom. That's okay. You need to get busy, Steve. Mrs. Jumbo had a baby boy. Does anybody know what this word is? Is this a real word or is this a short way to say a word?...What is the next thing that happened? Helen?

C They made fun of him.

T They made fun of him, didn't they? Should we say they teased him?

Ch Yeah.

T Okay. Let's put that down. I'm making mine stand on the line. I hope yours are. Boys and girls, why did I use the word "him?" Why didn't I say, "everyone teased her?" What's so important about the word "him?" Russ?

C He's a boy.

T He's a boy. So we have to say "him," don't you? Good. I wouldn't want to call him a girl. It might hurt his feelings. Okay, everyone teased him. I started with a capital. I ended with a period. Good. This is nice. You're doing a good job. You'll do about two more sentences and then you get to draw the picture. ...Steve, are you copying nice? Okay, then what happened? Did he learn to fly? (continues for two more sentences)

B. Text\_Contingent : When this category was marked, one of two phenomena was occurring: 1. only the language of the text was permitted, or 2. the text gave direction to the language and helped determine the nature of the activity.

ST T We're ready for the new story...Ready?  
Get your pointers. Let's read the story,  
"My Cat."

Ch (In unison) My cat is...

T Wait, wait, wait, wait, wait. That was the title. Let's read the title again. Ready.

T&Ch My Cat (Some children say, May Cat is.)

T Now we read the story.

Ch (In unison) My cat is black. She likes to play.

T Boy, that's about the shortest story we've had all week, isn't it? Usually our stories have about five or six sentences. So this one ought to be really simple. First sentence. Blank cat is black. What, Sue?

C My cat.

T My cat. ...We aren't on that one yet, Jess. Ready for number two? Here we go. My blank is black. Well, what's the story about, Helen?

C Cat.

T Cat. Write the word "cat." ...Cover up the story and see if you can fill that in. My cat is black. How many did that without looking? How many could remember the story? Very good. Look at the word "black."

WLT T After I read this story you may make some pictures for this book. So, you need to listen and pick out one of your favorite parts.

WLT T (Reading) He was very sad. A mouse came along. Why are you sad? I can't find my tail. I'll look for it. (This refrain is repeated throughout the story. The children soon knew the predictable text and read along with the teacher.)

C. Reader Contingent : This category was marked when the reader was encouraged or allowed to initiate or change a reading instruction activity.

WLT T How will you advertise your book? How will you get other people to read it? If we want'd to get the second graders interested in reading that book, or the kindergarteners?

C We could go over there and tell them about it.

C I know. I could go over there and read it.

C A play.

- T What?
- C Put on a play about it.
- T Put on a play about it. What else?
- C Sing a song.
- C Copy it. Write it on the board and then copy it.
- C Make a book about it.
- T ...Think of your own way...what you would do to get someone else to read the book or share the book with someone else. You think of it your own way. Would you make a book like Chris said? Make a picture to show it? Tell it to someone else?
- C Do a play about it.
- Ch Yeah. A play. A play. I say a play.
- T Great. You don't all have to do the same thing. If you need me to do anything for you, I will. There's paper back there to do books. If you need art paper it's in the cabinet. If you need to meet with other people on a play perhaps you can meet there.
- Ch (Become involved with their individual or small group projects.)

In the following example the activity is contingent on the reader and on the text he has read and wants to share with a group of children.

- WLT C (Reading) "He built a small house called a cocoon around himself. He started (corrects), stayed inside for more than two weeks. Then he nibbled on a hole in the cocoon, pushed his way out and..."
- C You forgot to show the picture.
- C (Shows picture)
- C You showed the wrong thing.. Oh, no, you didn't.
- C (Continues to read) He was a beautiful butterfly. (Shows picture)
- Ch I liked that. That was good.  
(Spontaneous applause)

E. Transactional : Louise Rosenblatt (1978) used this term to describe the relationship of readers and texts. In this study it was used to indicate the involvement of the reader, the text, and the teacher.

- WLT T&Ch (Have read and discussed The Little Old Man Who Couldn't Read . There is a group decision to make a grocery store in the room. The children have brought boxes, can, etc.)

Ch (Read labels of containers.  
Make advertisements for certain  
products.)

C I can't read this.

C Pretend you know how to write it.

WLT C (Reading) "I got my foot stuck in  
a gigantic lobster."

C Oh!

C A crab.

C A lobster, lobster.

T We have crabs around here. They  
have pinchers.

C My mother caught some crabs and  
killed them.

C (Reader) That's like a lobster.

#### V. Reader Stance Encouraged

This category was included to help us analyze another instructional focus. Louise Rosenblatt (1978) suggested that readers take two basic stances, aesthetic and efferent (non-aesthetic) when reading. These stances depend on the reader's intentions prior to and during reading. Rosenblatt said that in aesthetic reading the primary concern has to do with what happens to readers during the actual reading activity; attention is centered directly on what the readers are "living through" during their relationship with a particular text. In aesthetic reading the focus is on the present, what the reader senses, feels, imagines, and thinks with the text to create a new experience.

In nonaesthetic reading, the reader's attention is focused primarily on what will remain after the reading, that is, the information acquired, the logical solution to a problem and the actions to be carried out. In the classroom this nonaesthetic (efferent) reading often encouraged to teach objective facts, build concepts, learn formulae, follow directions, and build background knowledge.

A. Efferent Stance : This category was coded when the instructional materials or texts were used to teach objective facts or concepts for later recall.

ST T (Giving children worksheets) Okay, here  
we go...first page...ready. I have a  
gate, guh, guh, gate. What does it start  
with?

C G

T Good, would everybody take their pencil  
and make a G right on top of the gate.  
Just make a G. It doesn't matter, just  
make a G. Just so that you can remember  
that gate starts with a G.



- ST T Give me a nice sentence.  
 C Mrs. Jumbo had a baby boy.  
 T A baby elephant or a baby boy?
- ST T Then what happened? Did he learn how to fly? What happened next? Do you remember?  
 C He jumped..  
 T ...He jumped what?  
 C He jumped from the building.  
 T He jumped, he jumped from the building and then he did what?  
 C He started to fly.  
 T And he started flying, didn't he?

B. Aesthetic Stance : This category was marked when an aesthetic transaction between the reader and the text was encouraged or evident; when the primary emphasis was on the reader living the experience.

- WLT T (Stopping in the middle of a story) I wonder what happened. (Resumes reading)  
 Ch (Join the teacher in reading the repetitive lines.)  
 T Do you know what I think would be fun? Everybody could have one of those books and get with a friend and take turns. Find a comfortable place and sit down and read it to a friend.
- WLT T When you read this story see if it reminds you of anything you have ever thought of or felt before.  
 C Like when someone said something bad.  
 T Yes, like when someone teased you.

## VI. Miscellaneous

The miscellaneous category allowed for the coding of instances that helped identify the theoretical orientation of each teacher, but did not seem to fit into any other category. The various items in this category reflect an attitude toward language, literacy, and instruction of reading that each teacher presented to her students.

### A. Attention to author or illustrator :

- ST T The name of my story is, The Little Old Man Who Could Not Read . The book is by Erma Symington Black and the person is the...?  
 T&Ch (In unison) The author.  
 T Very good. That's the person...it's my

turn...that's the person that wrote the book.

B. Drawing and illustrating .

ST T I want you to color in dark crayon and black in the seams. Okay, I'm going to draw a shape just like this. Will you draw a triangle please? Okay, think of somethings that have a triangle. I'm thinking of something that you put ice cream on. What could we make that into, Steve?

T (The children are instructed to draw pictures of various traffic signs and finally...) Make a picture showing why reading is very important.

WLT T&Ch (Following the reading of The Little Old Man Who Could Not Read T&Ch discuss how pictures as well as words help identify the contents of a container.

Each student was given an empty container of a familiar grocery store item. There is a great deal of talking and sharing.)

T All of you will be making a big poster advertising your product? So, if you've got BOLD, you'll write the word BOLD and put the price and something that helps us recognize BOLD. If you have cereal, you might make a bowl of cereal and the name of it. What would you do if you have shampoo?

Ch (Discussion continues among the children as they begin their projects and determine the best way to represent their products.)

C. Copying :

ST T (Students are copying the date and letters of the alphabet) Boys and girls, when you are copying this, watch to see how tall mine are. (Places hands in horizontal position over words to show how tall they are) Don't make them way up with the sky if they're supposed to start mid-line. You make yours look just like mine.

WLT T What else might help you know what it is, Dee?

C Look on the box.

T And are you getting ready to trace it (the logo of the product)? That's a good

idea.

C I'm gonna trace it.

T Yes, you could just copy off the box, but that might be a little bit hard to do. You can copy as much as you want.

C Pretend like you know how to write?

T Well, you can copy the name off of it. You wouldn't have to pretend that, because it's right in front of you. What is yours? What does it say?

C Corn Flakes.

T Okay, so you could just write Corn Flakes, couldn't you?

C That's what I was going to do. Yes.

#### D. Virtues of Reading :

ST T Why is it important to learn how to read? The thing I am thinking about...reading is so very important...when it comes to being safe. The thing I'm thinking about is being very safe because if you can't read signs you'll have car accidents.

#### E. Moral Didactics (the perpetuation of cultural values concerning right/wrong and good/bad:

ST T (After reading a story about circus animals helping erect the circus tent) Now isn't it nice if everybody helps and then you get it done real good and fast?

WLT T Now was that nice of them to do that (laugh at the baby elephant) and say those things?

Ch No. No way. Nope, etc.

#### F. Correcting Oral Language :

ST T Where's your eraser?

C I don't got one.

T I don't got. Say, I do not have.

#### G. General Conversation :

ST Ch (Children are getting ready for a spelling test. They are talking with each other as they locate their paper and pencils.)

T What voice do we use during tests, Tony?

C Quiet.

T. Okay, Steve, do you belong that way?

ST T. My turn to talk. Your turn to listen.  
Zip, zip, zip. This is "fun sheet" time.

WLT C1 What's missing?  
C2 I know.  
C1 Donna. On the other pages, what's missing is a rabbit and a dog.  
C3 What did you say was missing?  
C2 I know what's going to happen.  
C1 It has something to do with the wagon.  
Ch (All four children in group respond and continue to listen to Chris who is reading a story to them)

#### H. General Movement :

ST T Okay, now let's do this. You'll need one pencil, good listening ears. Just like you just did.  
Ch (General movement back to desks)  
C I didn't get...  
T Oh, there are a lot of kids that didn't get to see Dumbo, but you'll get to see him before the day is over. I'll put him right over here.  
Ch (Move chairs to get a better view of Dumbo)  
T Shhhhhh. Okay, first graders. That's enough. You were so nice and quiet. Clell, what are you doing in Jack's desk? Now you don't bother somebody else's things.

WLT Group 1 (Six children and teacher are developing a wordless book)  
Group 2 (Four children are gathering art materials for a project)  
Group 3 (Three children are using a Big Book)  
Group 4 (Three children are writing on the board.  
(Several children are walking around the room. Their tasks are unidentifiable.)

## Discussion of Findings:

### I. Attention to Units of Language

In a skills model of reading, language is divided into parts and each part become a focus of instructional attention. In keeping with this assumption the ST's major instructional emphasis involved calling attention to sub-morphemic parts of language during reading instruction (sounds represented by individual letters and syllables) and during writing lessons (spelling by sounding-out, letter formation, punctuation, spacing). It is important to note that writing activities were included in this study because both teachers considered writing a part of their reading program. (Differences in their operational definitions of writing were vast, as will be evident below.)

Typical of submorphemic instruction and instructional reminders were: "Remember the F? We're going to say the sound three times fuh, fuh, fuh. Now the D. Duh, duh, deer." "Make your H start way at the top. That's a perfect E." "Always think about how the letters sound."

The skills teacher followed the skills paradigm by focusing on the smallest bits of language and drilling for perfection before going on to larger units of language.

When attention was focused on words, they were generally in the context of a worksheet, and the parts of words were often stressed, "Thurrrrrsday." "Now, fill in the blank with the word that ends just like the word in the picture." When the children were reading they were expected to read each word correctly, "Now when it's your sentence be sure to look at each word real carefully and get them right." When the focus appeared to be on a sentence, or on a story the ST took the opportunity to call attention to conventions such as punctuation, handwriting and spelling, as well as on the meaning of individual words, "Let's read this story. Now how does the first word start and what is at the end of the first sentence?"

In a whole language perspective the parts of language are not isolated and there is no attempt to remove language from natural context. To construct meaning was the focus of all the WLT's instructional activities. There was no direct instruction in sub-morphemic units of language. Although the children were never advised to sound out a word they used the strategy, especially when they were composing. In addition to using a sounding technique to help them spell, they paid attention to how words looked in print around them (on posters, bulletin boards, in books) and they consulted with other students, "Does that look right? It sounds right, but it don't look right. How do you spell wolf? Is it in that book?" The teacher encouraged children to pretend they knew how to spell words or to take a good guess, "Do the very best you can. I'm sure we will be able to read it." During the final editing phase of writing the teacher spelled words that the student previously had unsuccessfully attempted to spell.

When the WLT referred to words, the reference was grounded in a context of meaning. For example, the WLT called attention to her name tag, the students' names on the mailboxes, the "Dear" that begins

a letter, and the name that follows the letter's greeting. In all of these instances the words existed as part of a whole communication: The name tag is on the person, the labels are on the mailboxes and the greeting and names are part of a letter (correspondence). These instances retained and promoted meaning.

The predominant instructional activities in the WLT's classroom were: reading to the children from a variety of sources; encouraging children to predict words, sentences, and endings of stories read by the teacher; inviting the children to join the teacher in reading repetitive or cumulative lines in a story; writing; and reading (or "pretending to read") alone and with partners.

## II. Attention to Linguistic and Pragmatic Systems

In the skills approach to reading, linguistic systems (graphic/phonemic, lexical/grammatical and semantic), like the units of language, can be isolated and made the focus of instruction. The ST in this research spent the majority of the reading instructional time drawing the children's attention to sound symbol matching (phonics). Rules governing sound symbol relationships were also stressed. Written work (part of reading instruction) involved first and foremost appearance of written work. Correct and neat letter formation, spacing between words, standard margins, and copying the teacher's work were rewarded. The ST called attention to the use, in both reading and writing, of capital letters, periods, and especially exclamation marks. She mixed letters in words and used spelling to aid in "unlocking words." Attention to directionality (left to right, top to bottom) was evident in both reading and writing.

When attention was called to the lexical/grammatical system it involved the ST aiming for a rule application or for a text based answer. The teacher selected words she felt the children did not understand and provided immediate definitions or examples.

From the first day of data collection (the first day of school) the WLT always appeared to focus on the largest linguistic units and the largest cognitive units. She read stories and invited children to share ideas and concepts about the discourse. When meaning was not clear, the children were asked to provide definitions, examples and clarification; the teacher was a source of additional information. The reading strategy most often given by the WLT was, "Make it make sense to you." She encouraged the construction of meaning, seldom diverting attention away from that aim. She encouraged lexical/grammatical cueing by asking, "Does that sound right to you?" "Is that the word you would use?" The WLT indicated repeatedly to her students that conventions would develop naturally as they used language (read and wrote). Her focus was on the meaning brought to the literacy act by both the reader and the writer. There was no instance of instruction in letter or sound recognition, phonics or word drill.

The pragmatic environment of the ST classroom was one focused on school and schooling. Language stemmed from the teacher-text centered curriculum and was replete with such references. The children were encouraged to be quiet, neat, and to finish their work. The room, including bulletin boards, desks and work centers, was tidy.

In the WLT's classroom the pragmatic influences were moving forces in the development of the ongoing-curriculum. The situational

context involved moving the outside world into the classroom and in responding linguistically and instructionally to functional situations. There was a great deal of talking among children and the room was often noisy and untidy. The children were encouraged to finish their work, unless they had a suitable substitute activity, "If you don't like that book why don't you get another one or maybe work on your story. What do you need to do now?"

### III. Attention to the Reading Process

The ST deemphasized sampling from text; rather, she encouraged readers to attend to all the graphic cues. "Look close at each letter. Now don't rush. Look at each one and say the word." Occasionally, the children were encouraged to predict the next word while listening to the teacher reading a story. There were no examples of students being encouraged to predict as they read independently. There were many examples of children being asked recall questions on sentences or paragraphs that had just been read to them. The ST either directly and immediately (at the point of miscue) corrected or asked the children to correct their own reading miscues. Such correction was also typical of writing; that is, the children were directed to "correct at the point of invented spelling, omission of punctuation, non-standard spacing, etc. Confirmation of "correct reading and writing," as well as praise for correctly answered questions were standard procedures in the ST's classroom.

The WLT on occasion high-lighted each aspect of the reading process, but the emphasis never took the form of drill. She encouraged the children to sample from print when she suggested that they keep going in their reading even though they didn't know every word, and when she suggested that they might want to read a story "real fast." She encouraged them to predict (at a variety of linguistic levels) as she read stories and as the children read independently. She encouraged them to confirm their predictions and to construct meaning by relating their reading not only to the text, but to their past experiences as well. It was the WLT's procedure to encourage the children to self-correct either at the point of the miscue, or later in the text as the reader constructed more meaning and found it necessary to disconfirm earlier reading. If the reader did not correct, and completed the reading with misinformation or nonsense, the WLT would often ask, "Does that make sense to you?" This question encouraged prethinking and perhaps correction. If the miscues did not disrupt the meaning of the story, the teacher made no correction, but often asked, "Is there something in the story that caused you trouble?" The majority of coding related to the reading process was marked for the WLT in the All Systems (sampling, predicting, confirming and correcting) category. In both her instruction and in the activities she encouraged, the WLT emphasized the integration of all the aspects of the reading process.

### IV. Source of Register

The category Source of Register was included to help us examine the major influences that generated and directed instructional



reading activities. The question that guided the coding was: Was the observed activity initiated and controlled by the teacher, the text, the reader, a combination of any two, or an involvement of all three?

Without exception, all observable and coded activities that took place during reading instruction in the ST classroom, lasting more than two minutes, were initiated by the teacher and contingent on the teacher or the text. The single instance of instructional language initiated by a student and encouraged by the teacher lasted one minute. The two instances of transaction of the reader, the text and teacher (that is, all three were mutually responsible and involved) during reading instruction, lasted slightly less than two minutes. The majority of activities in the WLT classroom were considered transactions between the student the teacher and the material read. The teacher often initiated (or invited) an activity; changes and modifications in the assignment were made by the children.

#### V. Reader Stance Encouraged

To determine which stance (motivational mind-set) was encouraged during the reading instruction period, the following question was asked: What is expected of the students as they relate to printed texts and materials?

The ST focused on the residue of reading, that is, on predetermined information with which the children could come away from the reading. The focus had to do with getting information concerning letters and words, or giving short answers to recall questions.

In the WLT classroom the children were encouraged to experience the text and follow up with their own interpretations, questions, and presentations of their readings. The aesthetic stance did not appear to keep students in the WLT from remembering both significant and less significant aspects of the text. This was evident in their retelling of stories that they "lived through."

#### VI. Miscellaneous

This catch-all category is significant in that it captures examples and illustrations of the theoretical orientation of each teacher, and of how that orientation affects the use of language in reading instruction. If we were to say that both teachers made references to authors and illustrators, encouraged copying, and engaged in moral didactics, without looking at the specific episodes, it would be easy to believe that these two teachers were similar in some of their instructional procedures. Nothing could be farther from the truth. For example, in the categories of general movement and general conversation both teachers are coded; however, in the WLT classroom these categories were marked when children talked with their partners or worked in groups preparing a get-well card, or a play to present to the class. Inevitably, general discussion was coded simultaneously or following general movement. General movement in the ST classroom was coded when students moved from group to group or in and out of the classroom. Seldom was general discussion coded simultaneously.

There was one category, Correcting Oral Language, that was used by the ST, but never by the WLT.



### Summary and Conclusion:

In every category investigated the teachers adhered closely to their theoretical model of reading as indicated by the TORP. Primarily, the skills teacher focused attention on small units of language; encouraged the acquisition and mastery of rules and phonics generalizations; considered reading to be the exact representation of text; selected, initiated, and closely supervised all reading activities; utilized workbooks, flashcards, short controlled vocabulary stories; and encouraged the children to read to remember certain characteristics of or facts from the text.

In every area investigated, the whole-language teacher took a diametrically opposed instructional position. She focused the children's attention on the largest unit of language suitable for the situation; she encouraged the children to construct meaning that was sensible to them and their lives; she permitted deviations from text in that she allowed the children to miscue when reading; she pre-arranged the reading instructional time, but involved the children in both the short and long range planning; she utilized library books, reference books, text books, environmental print, child-authored stories; and she encouraged the children to "think about and feel" what they read.

The teachers were in agreement that writing activities should be included as an important part of learning to read. However, the teachers approached writing in different ways. The skills teacher designated a part of every day for letter formation practice, and the children often copied model letters, words, sentences and short stories from the board. She also considered spelling to be a part of writing instruction. The children seldom composed text. The whole-language teacher asked the children to write (compose) everyday. The children usually generated their own topics for writing, but the teacher often suggested that they write something appropos a story or book they had read together. Handwriting and spelling were not topics of instruction in the whole-language teacher's classroom. The children referred to alphabet cards when they needed information concerning letter formation; they were encouraged to "think through" the spelling of words on their own or they were helped by the teacher during conferences concerning the editing of their writings.

There is no doubt that these two first-grade teachers followed their theoretical bases closely and that because of their beliefs about reading, their reading instruction differed drastically. The evidence presented in these two classrooms provides parents and educators with specific information (sometimes referred to as hard data) on which to draw conclusions and make enlightened decisions concerning the theoretical bases on which they select to build their children's reading program.

## Bibliography

DeFord, Diane E. (1979). A Validation Study of an Instrument to Determine a Teacher's Theoretical Orientation to Reading Instruction. Dissertation, Indiana University.

Dillon, David & Searle, Dennis. (1981). The Role of Language in One First Grade Classroom. Research in the Teaching of English. Vol. 15, No. 4, 311-328.

Goodman, Kenneth S. (1982). The Reading Process. Language and literacy: The Selected Writings of Kenneth S. Goodman. Volume 2 Reading, Language and the Classroom Teacher. Ed. Frederick V. Gollasch. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.

Halliday, M.A.K. (1978). Language as social semiotic: The social interpretation of language and meaning. Baltimore: University Park Press.

Harste, J.C. & Burke, C.L. (1977). A new hypothesis for reading teacher education research: Both the teaching and learning of reading are theoretically based. In P.D. Pearson (Ed.), Reading: Research, theory and practice (26th Yearbook of the National Reading Conference). Minneapolis: Mason Publishing Co.

Rosenblatt, Louise M. (1978). The reader, the text, the room. Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press.